Review

Internal Trafficking in Persons in Tanzania: Qualitative Evidence from the Tanzania-Uganda Borderlands, Kagera Region

Switbert R Kamazima¹*, Method R Kazaura², Mangi J Ezekiel¹ and Claudia A Kamazima³

¹Behavioral Sciences Department, Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania
²Epidemiology and Biostatistics Department, Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania
³ Freelance Field Researcher, Tanzania

Abstract

Trafficking in persons (TIP) is recognized a global problem. Victims of TIP are mainly young males and females earmarked for working in plantations, construction and mining industry, domestic labor and sex works. In Tanzania, due to social imbalances, economic hardships and sometimes for political reasons, young males and females face internal trafficking; but cross-border trafficking is one of the growing businesses. Although the literature on TIP in Kagera Region is scarce, we cannot rule out this phenomenon. Therefore, the aim of this study was to gather evidence by analyzing available stories from ex-TIP victims in the Region. Data for this report are based on in-depth interviews and reports of ex-TIP victims from four northern border districts of Kagera region. Also, we interviewed community members and village and ward leaders. There is enough evidence that due to social and economic hardships, young males and females have been trafficked to destinations within the region with promises to get better standard of living. In most cases, TIP victims and their family members are deceived by relatives or people known to them. Some of the mentioned engagements include domestic work, fishing, sexual exploitation, farming and plantation labor, construction and mining. Community leaders and members reported were unaware of the anti-TIP Act. Consequently, they do not consider TIP a crime. Trafficking in persons is going on in Kagera Region. Factors associated with TIP include poverty, ignorance and lack of awareness of TIP being a crime. Therefore, creating awareness of TIP, raising living standards among community members by improving the production and price of cash crops and combating farm diseases are likely to alleviate the TIP in the Region.

Key Words: Internal Trafficking; Trafficking in Persons; Qualitative Study; Kagera; Borderlands, Tanzania

Introduction

Trafficking in persons (TIP) is recognized as a modern form of slavery, exploitation and human rights violation [1] Globally, TIP is increasingly becoming a social, economic, political and legal concern. Tanzania is well known as a country of origin, transit and destination of trafficked human beings. For example, the 2014 Global Slavery Report reported “Tanzania was leading in East Africa for having more than 350,000 people trafficked within and outside the country.” Globally, Tanzania ranks 33rd out of 167 countries on the list of notorious countries with respect to TIP [2]. In this respect, The US Department of State (2015; 2016; 2017) reports present TIP profile in Tanzania and the rest of East African countries to include rural-urban trafficking, subjecting girls for domestic services and sex work to South Africa, Europe and the Middle East [3]. Boys are internally trafficked for labor in farms and agriculture, cattle grazing and in the mines.

*Corresponding Author: Switbert R Kamazima, Behavioral Sciences Department, Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania, E-mail: skamazima@gmail.com

Sub Date: June 11th, 2018, Acc Date: June 22nd, 2018, Pub Date: June 22nd, 2018.


Copyright: © 2018 Switbert R Kamazima. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.
According to MoHSW/NACP (2010) and Kamazima, et al. (2012), cases of child trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation are increasingly reported in the country, particularly along the international borders and in tourist parts of the country [4,5]. Boys are subjected to forced labor, primarily on the farms and plantations, but also in the mines, the informal sector and possibly on small fishing boats and soldering (from the refugee camps). The girls are subjected mainly to domestic work and sex exploitation in tourist areas within and outside the country. Girls and boys aged between 10 and 17 years are trafficked from rural to urban or within rural areas to be exploited as agricultural plantations workers, construction laborers, street vendors, domestic workers, sex workers, bar attendants, street beggars, fishermen and peasant miners.

MoHSW/NACP (2010) and Kamazima, et al. (2012) reported women and men were trafficked from rural to urban areas for labor or sexual exploitation, domestic work, commercial agriculture, fishing, mining, and prostitution, many of whom end up engaging in activities that put them at risk of health problems including HIV and sexually transmitted infections (STI). Mwita (2013) observed that "[V]illage leaders or ward executive officers are alleged to give the girls false identity cards and the teachers give the girls false primary school education completion certificates ….

So, the groups of people who support migrating girls include teachers, police officers, nurses, doctors and social welfare workers" [6].

According to Mirondo (2011), some women and young girls are trafficked to Oman, Europe, Middle East and the United Arab Emirates (UAE) to serve as house girls or into forced prostitution [7]. The U.S Department Report (2015; 2016; 2017) indicated that smaller numbers of Tanzanian children and adults are trafficked often by fellow Tanzanians into conditions of forced marriages, sex trafficking and domestic servitude in other countries including South Africa, the UAE, Oman, the United Kingdom, Saudi Arabia, France, the United States and possibly other African, Middle Eastern, and European countries. Goldberg (2015) established that Tanzanian girls are commonly subjected to sex trafficking in China [8].

Poverty, domestic servitude, the breakdown of the family ties, HIV and AIDS impact, poor education, parents’ trust over the traffickers and ignorance of conditions at places of destination are some of the reasons reported fueling rural-urban migration and trafficking in Tanzania. On the one hand, Iringa, Mwanza, Singida, Kilimanjaro, Morogoro, Mbeya, Arusha, Shinyanga, Dodoma, Tanga and Kagera regions are reported the major sending regions [4,5,6].

On the other hand, Dar-es-Salaam, Mwanza, Zanzibar and Arusha cities are reported the main destinations of internal trafficking [4,9]. In addition, it has been reported that children in the country’s large refugee population are trafficked to work on farms or soldering [3,4,5]. The Global Slavery Index (2013) revealed that between 310,000 and 350,000 people in Tanzania are living in conditions of modern slavery [10], ranking 29 out of 162 countries surveyed [11].

Describing the categories of victims of TIP in urban and rural Tanzania, Mwita (2013) wrote "So, you find in towns underage quarry stone crackers, shoe-shine boys, fitters, cart pushers, sand miners, prostitutes, domestic hands, farm helps and even factory laborers ... In rural areas, you find land tillers, cattle minders, cutters of hut construction poles, firewood collectors and even hunters of wild animals, some of which are vicious. Many of these young workers are virtual slaves" [6].

On the one hand, Goldberg (2015) and the US Department of State (2017), indicate that Tanzania is placed on Tire 2 Watch List because it was considered dormant in complying with the minimum standards to end human trafficking and has insufficient or substandard laws against human trafficking [3,8].

According to the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, Tier 2 Watch List includes countries whose governments do not fully comply with the Trafficking Victims Protection Act’s (TVPA) minimum standards, but are making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with those standards and meet one of the following criteria: 1) display high or significantly increasing number of victims; 2) have failed to provide evidence of increasing efforts to combat trafficking in persons or, 3) have committed to take action over the next year.

On the other hand, there is evidence that The United Republic of Tanzania (URT) has made remarkable efforts to end TIP and its discontents as stated in the National Anti-Trafficking Action Plan (2015-2017) [12]. Efforts made include enacting the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act’s (ATiPAct) minimum standards, but are making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with those standards and meet one of the following criteria: 1) display high or significantly increasing number of victims; 2) have failed to provide evidence of increasing efforts to combat trafficking in persons or, 3) have committed to take action over the next year.

Referred to the definitions of TIP, TIP victim and a trafficker provided by the ATiPAct 2008, TIP studies in Tanzania have indicated there is lack of understanding and knowledge of TIP and low awareness on the existence of The ATiPAct 2008 among Tanzanians, the political elite and common citizens alike [4]. Kamazima, et al., (2016) further reported, "there is no uniform understanding of the definition of TIP. The understanding of elements of TIP decreases with hierarchy (from national to grassroots levels) [and] one of seven (15%) of study sample either did not know or did not consider TIP a crime" [14] In addition, members of TIP control machinery were not aware of this responsibility as per the ATiPAct 2008.
As a result, non-reporting and underreporting of TIP incidents coupled with “[TIP research] methodological difficulties and challenges associated with estimating sizes of hidden populations such as trafficking victims [and traffickers]” [15] render inaccurate data available on the magnitude of this crime globally and specifically, in the country. Consequently, available information on TIP flows and forms of exploitation in Kagera Region is extremely scanty. In this paper we analyze and present life stories of some ex-TIP victims and interviews with community members and village authorities demonstrating exploitation, flows and forms of internal TIP uncontrollably going on in this administrative region of Tanzania.

Material and Methods

Data analyzed for this paper are part of ongoing qualitative study in four border districts of Kagera Region, Tanzania: Bukoba Rural, Bukoba Urban, Missenyi and Kyerwa. We conducted 55 in-depth interviews (IIs) on TIP-related issues with border village leadership (9), three (3) district officials, proxy-traffickers (3) and self-identified and reported TIP ex-victims (40) of whom 10 were trafficked more than once by same or different traffickers. Due to the sensitivity around TIP and events that were taking place in the Tanzania-Uganda borderlands (re-identification and intensification of the border, citizens’ registration for national identification and soldier patrols) at the time of this study, all IIs were hand-recorded except 12 conducted with the village leaders and district officials that were audio-recorded. Following data collection, tapes were transcribed verbatim by team members in each border district and IIs reports written on the same day of interviewing were submitted to the PI and Co-PIs (the team leaders in four districts). In order to maintain quality and richness of content, we analyzed data in Kiswahili (the national language used during interviews) and English translation was then carried out.

We contextualized life stories demonstrating situations the TIP ex-victims experienced during trafficking processes and how their opinions and decisions of searching for ‘better life’ changed over time. Also, we were able to explore and identify common and dominant features of TIP embedded in the narratives.

We asked the ward and village leaders about the main activities conducted by community members in their areas to earn their living or survive. One of the common activities reported was “migrating to other areas within and outside the region seeking paid labor.” We then asked them if they knew the kind of labor these ‘migrants’ were engaged in and the methods used to recruit them. Reported kind of labor and recruitment methods suggested internal TIP rather than migration was taking place in the study area. We further asked the leaders if they were aware of TIP, the ATIPact 2008 and their role in controlling TIP. Again, the leaders’ narratives indicated low awareness of the three issues, which necessitated the research team to discuss these issues in details with them. Finally, we asked the leaders who reported knowing TIP victims to identify and connect us to at least three of them. With these connections, we met with the TIP victims and arranged for IDIs. We conducted interviews with 40 TIP victims and collected their life stories. In this paper we present life stories from three TIP victims who were trafficked more than once: LS1 (SS), LS2 (NJ) and LS3 (DM) (not real names).

We also conducted in-depth interviews among community members (men and women) aged 18 years and above; village authorities, proxy-traffickers (community members knowledgeable about the traffickers’ characteristics and trafficking activities). The interview guide focused on, among others, key informants’ (KIs) understanding of TIP, factors behind TIP practices in their areas, flows and forms of TIP in the region and their recommended means to curb this ever increasing public health problem and heinous crime.

The Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences Institutional Review Board granted research clearance (MUHAS IRB, Ref. No. 2017-09-29/EAC/Vol.XII/73) for this study. We requested and obtained permission to conduct the study from regional, district, division and ward authorities. Due to the sensitivity of issues around TIP and residence in the borderlands, study participants granted oral informed consent. Data analysis continued throughout the process of data collection following three stages of qualitative data analysis: data reduction, data display and conclusion drawing and verification [16]. Constant comparative techniques were used to analyze the data [17] around TIP themes and issues that emerged from the life stories and the IDIs.

Results

For the purpose of this paper, we present life stories from three interviewed TIP ex-victims who were trafficked more than once: LS1 (SS), trafficked twice for road construction; LS2 (NJ), trafficked twice for domestic labor and LS3 (DM), trafficked twice for labor in fishing and sugar plantation.

LS1 (SS): Trafficked Twice for Road Construction by the Same Trafficker

“My name is SS. I was born in 1988. I am a first born to a Moslem family of four. I grew up and went to school in my home village in Bukoba Rural district, Kagera Region. I underwent madrasat training in this village and I completed primary education in 2002. I married my first wife immediately after school in 2004 and we are blessed with two children aged 12 and 10. In 2006, I married a second wife. We have one child aged 10. I am a farmer owning ekibanja [a farm land], where I grow coffee, bananas and perennials …. I have three ankole [long honed] cows and about 10 chicken. I also conduct petty business; running a kiosk selling retailed commodities at the village center. I often buy and sell unsorted items at open markets operating in the division from Tuesdays through Saturdays. During business peaks, I travel as far as Buserasere/Katoro, Biharamulo and Mwanza just trying my luck. I can confidently say that I
am almost self-sufficient, taking care of my family and my parents. I also economically and socially assist other members of my extended family and fellow villagers.

“As you may remember, 2016/2017 was a bad year for many of Kagera residents. We were hit by prolonged drought that resulted into hunger and later famine. Most of the region missed omuhanguko (August/Sept - December rains); a few areas received rain for a short period. As a result, all the crops we had planted and the bananas dried out. By December 2016/January 2017, individuals and many families were totally desperate; very few families could afford one meal a day. Majority of the households depended on ripe mangoes. Similarly, we missed etoigo (March – May/June rains). So, we exhausted our empanika (food and money reserves) and depended on unpalatable food such as entilimbe (poorly prepared dried cassava) brought in our area by businesspersons from outside the region. Food prices went high and higher and money circulation among the villagers shrank rapidly pushing us into severe poverty ... Some households lost cattle, goats and sheep due to lack of pasture and water ... Casual labor became severely scarce in this area ... I remember, some families sold their animals at throw away prices to buy food or exchanged them for food. Four husbands from this village run away from their families avoiding shame from food theft or losing a family member to hunger. It was terrible for abanaku, the poor and abatungi/abagaiga, the rich.

“In March 2017, a fellow villager known to have ‘connections’ with the ‘outside world’ brought ‘good news’ to us the young men in our village. He passed messages around, by a word of mouth and via cell phones (SMS), about a ‘deal’ he had struck for us. A road construction company based in Bukoba Town was recruiting about 300 laborers to work in Missenyi District at attractive remunerations: good salary ranging between TShs 30,000 ($13) and TShs 50,000 ($21.7) per day (depending on one’s exertion), good living conditions (accommodation and food), medical care and if proven hard working, one could secure permanent employment. Demonstrating his generosity and sympathy to the potential recruitees, he claimed reserving 15 positions (out of 20 apportioned to him) for young men from our village. To my colleagues and I, this ‘deal’ came as a blessing and if possible start working right away.

As you may remember, 2016/2017 was a bad year for many of Kagera residents. We were hit by prolonged drought that resulted into hunger and later famine. Most of the region missed omuhanguko (August/Sept - December rains); a few areas received rain for a short period. As a result, all the crops we had planted and the bananas dried out. By December 2016/January 2017, individuals and many families were totally desperate; very few families could afford one meal a day. Majority of the households depended on ripe mangoes. Similarly, we missed etoigo (March – May/June rains). So, we exhausted our empanika (food and money reserves) and depended on unpalatable food such as entilimbe (poorly prepared dried cassava) brought in our area by businesspersons from outside the region. Food prices went high and higher and money circulation among the villagers shrank rapidly pushing us into severe poverty ... Some households lost cattle, goats and sheep due to lack of pasture and water ... Casual labor became severely scarce in this area ... I remember, some families sold their animals at throw away prices to buy food or exchanged them for food. Four husbands from this village run away from their families avoiding shame from food theft or losing a family member to hunger. It was terrible for abanaku, the poor and abatungi/abagaiga, the rich.

“We started our journey from our village to Bukoba around 9.55 am. We were silent all the way to Bukoba Town with a few whispers among ourselves. We arrived at Rwamishenye where we would find our ‘host’ waiting for us. ‘Each of you should pay TShs 4,000 ($1.7). Mugendege [have a nice trip]’ he said to us and waved as the bus pulled off. To us, this was the beginning of a journey to the ‘Promised Land’. Certainly, each of us was eager to meet the reported to be ‘generous boss’ and if possible start working right away.

“We arrived in Bugabo at around 6.30 pm. We were dumped in an abandoned building with no doors and in bad conditions. We were joined by other 24 [total of 36] young men from Bugabo area. We were told to share the two rooms available. He gave us no food that night.
“On Monday morning, the ‘boss’s agent arrived giving us work conditions: ‘you will be given maize flour for ugali, dagaa (sardines), salt and water … The working site is 8km away … your day’s piece work is digging three trenches for TShs 5,000 per head per day’ … The next morning we walked to the site and worked till 6 pm without food but had water we collected from the nearby stream … The trench was two and a half to three feet deep and between two and three miters long … Back to the house we asked for a possibility of living close to the site and more tools. The answer was ‘this is all we can offer’. They had given us few and new tools: hoes, pangas and pickaxes without handles … One of our colleagues from our group who fell sick left the same night for home … Ugali with dagaa, salt and was our main food.

“On Tuesday, we left the house at 4 pm on foot reaching the site at around 6.45 am. The agent instructed us to finish yesterday’s piece works and start new day’s piece work so that he could pay us … It was a lie!! We left for the house at 6 pm without any cent and on empty stomachs … He promised paying us the next day when the boss brings cash.

“Four of us from our group [from his village] plotted leaving the camp the next day on foot. We left at 5 am and reached the main road to Bukoba Town at 10 am. We reached downtown around 5 pm … weak and very hungry. At Rwamisheny e [on Bukoba-Biharamulo road] we were asked to pay TShs 2,000 ($0.9) to our village that we could not afford … One truck driver allowed us to board to a place about 20 km from our village … On the way he changed his mind to another direction. We decided to walk reaching our village well past midnight … The next day [Friday]; we called the agent requesting him to send us our two days’ payment. He replied ‘you did not finish your work’.

“On Saturday, the ‘boss’ called us to return to the site where he would refund the bus fare and advance payment enabling us to send some money to our families. On Monday morning we boarded a bus to Rwamisheny e at the ‘boss’s’ house. This time, each of us had at least TShs 10,000 ($4.3) balance. We arrived at around 9 am; the ‘boss’ vanished till 6 pm. After half an hour, he packed us in a pickup; arriving at a new site around 8 pm. The hosting old woman gave us a small portion of ugali with dagaa and water that night … She warned us of getting out of the house at night without her permission … We had a sleepless night.

“Since we were on a different site and did not meet our colleagues, we were not sure of what would happen … We could smell a rat … We [four of them] decided to escape and return home the next morning. We quietly left the house around 5 am arriving at Bukoba Town at 12 noon. On our way home on a bus, the ‘boss’ called asking us to disembark and wait for him to collect us within the next half hour. We told him we had no such intention … We could only do so if he sent us our money via M-PESA. He did not reply till we reached our village at around 2 pm … We never received our payment to date! We have been informed that this is Mr. X’s behavior, an oppressor of many young men in this district.

“I have learnt a lesson, I cannot leave the village for work unless I am sure of the conditions promised and our village authorities notified of the contract … You know, even if we could have died, our families and village leaders had no information about this contract or where we had headed for … Our families would have suffered a lot … I am satisfied with what I earn from the business I conduct from home … Asante [Thanks]” [18].

LS2 (NJ): Trafficked Twice for Domestic Work in the Urban and Rural Areas

“My name is NJ born 18 years ago in Muleba district. I am the only child to my mother. I am told my parents divorced when I was 2 years old. My mother remarried an old man in this village [in Bukoba Rural district] who had no child … He was too poor to send me to school … When he died at the age of about 60 years my mother too could not afford sending me to school … I was 8 years old … At the age of 10 [2009], a male neighbor [name] living in town [Bukoba] asked my mother to take me to town to take care of their one-year old child and have an opportunity to go to school. My mother was hesitant to let me go because she thought I was too young to leave her and she would have no one to help her … She asked for two days to make her mind … The next day, the neighbor returned claiming he had found another girl [name] whose parents [names] were willing to let her go … So, my mother had to make a quick decision … She reluctantly allowed me to go on grounds that the neighbor provides me good care and pays me TShs 10,000 ($4.3) per month that I should use to buy clothes and school materials. The neighbor gave my mother TShs 10,000 ($4.3) advance that would be deducted from my salary during the first year of my ‘employment’. I really thanked my mother to letting me out of the village for town for the first time in my life.

“We left the village for Bukoba Town by bus the next day [Saturday] morning … We arrived at Bukoba Town around 10 am and we were in Kashai [just off downtown] half an hour later. We were received by the wife … After a short conversation with the husband in the language I did not know [apparently English], she asked me if I had ever worked as a house girl … My answer was ‘NO’ … Then she asked how much I should be paid and on what terms … I said my mother had made arrangements with ‘Baba’ [the husband] … Within the next hour, she had showed me around the house and explained my duties … cooking, taking care of the child, washing clothes and utensils, cleaning the house and the compound and guarding the house while they are away. In addition, she warned me of talking to neighbors or leaving the house without her permission.

“I started working on the same day under her supervision till about 10 pm when we went to bed … I was sleeping in the sitting room … That is, I was the first one to wake up and the last one to go to bed … The worst days were
when we had visitors, I would sleep well after midnight. I worked for long hours without rest, sometimes two or three activities at a time ... I was not allowed to share their meals … I ate ugali with dagaa and sometimes vegetables [in the kitchen] … On rare occasions, rice or bananas with meat or fish … Remember, I was the one doing all the cooking! ‘Mama’ used to yell at me sometimes without any reason, just to please herself!

“I worked under such conditions for three months. One day I asked ‘Baba’ about going to school and my salary ... Quickly ‘Mama’ replied, ‘You cannot go to school until our son [name] starts nursery school ... Your salary caters for your meals, accommodation and the clothes [second-hand] we give you ... What else do you need?’ I remained quiet and left for the kitchen crying.

“One day I fell sick … ‘Mama’ gave me pain killers and kept me working, she never took me to the hospital! The other time I was sick, ‘Baba’ was around … He took me to the dispensary where I was diagnosed to have malaria. The doctor advised me to have a total rest for a quick recovery; but I had to work as if nothing had happened ... ‘Mama’ could not allow me take a rest … The next day, ‘Mama’ came home early only to find that I had not done much of my duties. She bit me … yelling I was so lazy, just wasting their food and other resources and I could go back home ... She could get another girl to work for her ... I felt very sad remembering my mother’s care that I missed at that time. The joy I had before leaving the village had perished! ... [Rising hands in the air] Mungu mkubwa [God is great].

“During the sixth month of my stay with this family, a neighbor from our village came to visit us. I had time to inform her all the sufferings I was going through and asked her to ask my mother to come and take me home, which she did. A week later, on Saturday, my mother came; she had a long discussion with them [‘Baba’ and ‘Mama’] ... She threatened reporting them to the police if they would not let me leave. My mother furiously pulled me out of the house and we left for home … I left behind all I had [a few clothes and a pair of open shoes] ... They never paid me even a cent for all six months I worked for them [approximately TShs 60,000 or $26].

“During the sixth month of my stay with this family, a neighbor from our village came to visit us. I had time to inform her all the sufferings I was going through and asked her to ask my mother to come and take me home, which she did. A week later, on Saturday, my mother came; she had a long discussion with them [‘Baba’ and ‘Mama’] … She threatened reporting them to the police if they would not let me leave. My mother furiously pulled me out of the house and we left for home … I left behind all I had [a few clothes and a pair of open shoes] … They never paid me even a cent for all six months I worked for them [approximately TShs 60,000 or $26].

“I stayed at home nursing my wounds for four years ... As you know; village life is not that much friendly due to poverty. I needed kibarua [paid labor] to make ends meet. In June 2013, my mother’s friend [name] informing us that a successful businessman’s family at the next village’s center needed a house girl. In her view, I was the only girl in the area who could quickly think of to acquire this opportunity ... Our family knew about this family ... We used to buy supplies from their shop or sell our crops to them whenever we needed money … We also go to the same Church … Based on this relationship, I was willing to work for them … Yet, I knew I would be close to home compared to when I was in Bukoba Town. My mother asked meeting the family to set terms for my new job. Three days later, the family [husband and wife] came to meet and negotiate with my mother ... They promised paying TShs 25,000 ($8.7) per month, provide food, accommodation, health care and a 30 days annual leave. My mother explained to them the hardships I had gone through while in Kashai [Bukoba Town]. They assured her of treating me as part of their family … She should not worry at all ... I moved to that family’s premises three days after.

“‘My chores included cooking, washing clothes and utensils, taking care of three children aged between 2 and 6 years, cleaning the house and the compound, attending visitors and sometimes doing some shamba [farm] work or attending their animals [cows, goats and pigs] and poultry. I worked for more than 18 hours ... Sometimes I would sleep for two hours only a day … I shared a room [in the main house] with their youngest child aged 2, whom on some days, kept me awake all the night. I was not allowed to leave the house without Mama’s permission, receive any visitor from home, not even my mother, or use a cell phone ... They suspected we could steal food and other items from the house.

“At the end of the first month, ‘Mama’ told me that she had a good plan for my money [salary]. She asked not paying me until I go on leave ... About TShs 300,000 ($130.4). I accepted the plan because I wanted to buy an embroidery machine for my mother to generate some income [crying] ... It did not happen ... A month later, my mother fell sick, ‘Baba’ told me they [the family] would take care of her … not allowing me to visit her at the hospital [name]. I was so depressed ... After a week, I run away in the middle of the night for home … I visited my mother at the hospital the next morning to take care of her … My mother recovered and was discharged a week later ... We sold our three goats to cover hospital bills ... Here we are ... They never paid me [crying] … Asante [thanks] [18].

**LS3 (DM): Trafficked Three Times for Labor – Fishing, on Tea Plantation and on Sugar Plantation**

“My name is DM born in Muleba district in 1978. I completed primary education in 1996 and married two years after [1998]. I am a father of four. I have a farm, ekibanja and we keep a few chicken and twelve goats.

“In 1996, we received information from the Ward Executive Officer that a successful fisherman in Lake Victoria has sent an agent to our village to collect about 40 young men to work at his fishing camps in the lake. Interested young men had to register at the village office in two days time, and then would leave for the fishing sites. Each aspirant had to pay TShs 1,500 ($0.7) for registration. The agent told us each of us shall be paid TShs 50,000 ($21.7) per month, accommodation, treatment and adequate food. He managed to get only 35 of us.

“We were at the first site [name] after travelling on the lake for one to two hours at night, where 10 of us disembarked leaving the other 25
Continuing with safari to the other two sites [names]. We met about 50 other young men from Muleba and Bukoba [Rural] districts and about 15 women who did the cooking [food vending]. There was no sleeping place but four small ruined thatched huts; about 18 fishing boats and several fishing nets … We did not eat that night because we had nothing to cook.

Early in the morning, we were given a cup of black tea each and asked to board the boats for work. Each boat had a supervisor and two or three of us. We returned around mid-day with good catch of fish. The supervisors informed us that we shall be paid according to the catch … With adequate catch; we would get TShs 3,000 ($1.3) and TShs 1,500 ($0.7) or a few fish on inadequate and poor catch days respectively … The condition was that we are not allowed to go home until after six months [it was a high fishing season] … Whoever fell sick took care of himself … We worked for long hours, often spending several nights on the lake … We spent much time drying sardines, smoking fish and repairing boats and nets … We took inadequate food compared to the work we did … I worked for two years without returning home and without any substantial gain … I did not feel like going home but enjoyed life at the camp … One day I felt home sick, seriously remembered my family and the sufferings I was going through … I left the camp and returned home empty handed … not even a single fish or cash.

“I stayed home for 9 years trying to rework my farm. However, given the poverty situation we faced in our village, in 2007 I decided joining a team of 20 young and mid aged men recruited from our village to work for [name] tea plantation. We were promised of TShs 1,500 payment per kg of tea leaves harvested each day and after one year probation, one could secure permanent employment in the tea factory. We had to rent rooms in the neighboring villages and buy food … Remember, I had no money to pay rent and buy food … I borrowed some cash from fellow workers … The supervisors informed us that we would be paid TShs 600 ($0.3) per kg of picked tea and every other week, which put me in hard conditions … My friend picking tea leaves is not a jock … You have your hands … You do not eat that night because you have nothing to cook.

“Now I know the problems involved in such contracts. I cannot leave home until I am sure of the working conditions failure of which, I shall remain in the village doing paid work that enables me to support my family and other relatives … Asante [thanks]” [18].

**A Proxy-Trafficker Reporting on Trafficking for Labor: Mining in Muleba District**

We also interviewed a proxy-trafficker in Missenyi who reported on a case he recalled where about 60 young males were trafficked from Muleba Town to Kimwani area to work on a ‘newly discovered gold mine.’ He reported as follows:

“I remember it was in November last year [2017], a businessman [name] in Muleba claimed to have discovered gold in Kimwani [about 35 km from Muleba Town] and he needed workers to labor at his mine for a good pay of TShs 1,000,000 ($434.8) and about TShs 2,000,000 ($869.6) per month for the cooks and the miners respectively. He claimed he would increase the salary depending on gold yields. He also promised good accommodation and health care for workers falling sick … Desperate young men showed up at his premises and were transported to Kimwani … They found no accommodation, they ate ugali with beans or dagaa [sardines] … They worked for long hours with short rest … They worked for three months without salary … They organized themselves and took him to court … I think he was forced to pay them … Just go to Muleba or Kimwani and conduct interviews about this event [18].

**Knowledge and Awareness of TIP**

We asked our interviewees if they knew about TIP and if they were aware of the ATIPAct 2008. None of the TIP victims and a proxy-trafficker knew anything about TIP or was aware of the law prohibiting TIP activities in the country. All they knew was that they had migrated to undertake paid labor to generate money. Their ‘bosses’ and the agents were eager to make...
profits out of their labor. That is why they paid them low salaries or not at all. After explaining to them about this crime and its characteristics, each was surprised that they and their colleagues were TIP victims. LS3 (DM) added, “[I]f this is the case, then every young man in my village has been trafficked at least once in his life time” [18]. LS1 (SS) promised holding discussions with fellow villagers, the young men in particular, on TIP to avoid further impacts. LS2 (NJ) promised using her membership in three women’s social groups (*ebunya*) and other venues to spread a word on TIP and its evils.

Among the village and district leaders interviewed, a few had heard about TIP at seminars and meetings but did not consider it a concern or a crime going on in their areas. They concurred there was high internal migration going on for labor but not TIP because, they though, individuals move willingly. After a long discussion explaining TIP and its features, they promised making follow up of vivid cases we had gathered from their areas. Consequently, they were not aware of their responsibility to control TIP as per The ATiPAct 2008. Other members of the community we discussed this issue with had no idea that TIP was going on in their areas but in other regions of the country where police have been arresting men from Ethiopia on their way to South African countries.

**Factors Behind TIP**

All study participants mentioned poverty a key push factor for falling prey of TIP. The ex-TIP victims, for example, mentioned that poverty pushed them to leave their homes to take opportunities of the said ‘good job’. Explaining how he perceives poverty and its contribution to TIP in the study area, a male retired civil servant participant narrated,

> A combination of events has resulted in extreme poverty experienced in this area: crop diseases – all crops bananas, coffee and cassava; drought, fall in coffee price and of recent crackdown on what they call ‘illegal fishing’ … The 2016/2017 drought left us in shambles … We had no food, hence forced to sell our properties at throw away prices to feed our families … Others decided to seek paid labor … We survived on mangoes …We used growing bananas, which gave us adequate produce for our food and surplus for sale … We thus had enough to eat and cash to upkeep our families … *Mnyauko* [Banana Xanthomonas Wilt, BXW] has deprived us all this … Some families have lost between 25% and 100% of their banana plants … Some households can only afford one meal a day, which has seriously affected our health … Coupled with low returns from coffee production and the impact of diseases attacking other food and cash crops, we are unable of maintaining our families, sending our children to school or paying for medical services … Beginning in late 1990s [1998], the government has shaken fishing activities in this region … Prohibiting fishing activities on some lakes, Ikimba, Kajunje and Burigi and introduced patrols on *enyanja Rweru* [Lake Victoria] … Beginning 2017 and now 2018, the police confiscate fishing nets, boats, engines and arrest fishermen for charges … Majority of them [fishermen] have lost their capital and sources of income … They are now back in the villages into poverty … Tuli ahabi or we are in a real worse situation … Desperte young and mid aged men and women will accept any opportunity that comes on their way, whether willingly migrating or trafficked [18].

Increasing labor demand in all sectors in rural and urban areas: road and building construction, services, fishing, agriculture, manufacturing, domestic services and mining were reported the pulling factors for internal TIP in the study area. Explaining this situation, a participant reported, “There has been a course of everyone engaging in economic activities both in the rural and urban areas, which means demand for additional labor than the family can supply necessitating hiring someone to support … Did you expect finding house girls/maids in this village? The situation is the same in rural and urban areas” [18].

A Ward Executive Officer interviewed in Missenyi commented, “Low awareness/ignorance of TIP, The ATiPAct 2008 and its poor reinforcement in the area contribute to TIP problem as you [researcher] have observed in our area … We unknowingly participate in or encourage TIP” [18]. A female member of the village government interviewed in Missenyi stated, “We knew nothing about TIP, its features and that it is a crime … We did not know that the law against TIP exists in this country and that we are part of the TIP control machinery as per the law [The ATiPAct 2008] … All these factors contribute to the magnitude of the problem observed in our region” [18].

All ex-TIP victims noted that ignorance of conditions at destination coupled with the need for money contributed greatly to their fall in TIP trap. LS1 (SS) explained,

> The recruiters and traffickers tell lies about the conditions at the destinations to entice potential desperate victims and turn them blind and unable to analyze situations … Unfortunately, they get discouraged and frustrated of the real situations on the site when it is too late … Another factor is that we do not share information due to fear of shame of what happened … If we could have passed our experience to our fellow villagers and the village leadership, something could have been done to control this problem at least at the village level [18].

**Flows and Forms of TIP**

From the life stories presented, it was clear that internal TIP flows in Kagera are rural-rural, rural-urban and urban-urban. The direction taken depends on the site location or where a person in need of labor is based.
Again, the number of individuals trafficked depends on several factors like availability of potential victims and number of laborers needed. In all cases presented, the traffickers made transport arrangements (private or public) or used company transport. Forms of TIP presented included, road and building construction, fishing, agriculture, sex exploitation, manufacturing, domestic services and mining.

Interviews with members of the fishing camp in Bukoba Rural indicated that female food vendors traffic in young, innocent and beautiful girls to attract customers whom they may end up having sex with to get additional income and secure sleeping places on some nights [18]. Similarly, interview data from Missenyi suggested that some girls and young women were trafficked from most of Kagera, Uganda, Burundi and Rwanda to Mutukula Town during the 2007/2008 client boom, the long distance truck drivers and other visitors. In addition, some informants reported old prostitutes (mamas) and some men traffic girls and young women from the mainland into the islands (in Lake Victoria) for sex exploitation [18].

**Recommendations to Curb TIP**

Participants who recognized low awareness of TIP, its characteristics and The ATiPAct 2008 among authorities and the citizens as a key factor for TIP problem in their area suggested raising TIP and ATiPAct 2008 awareness among the citizenry to be a major remedy to this situation. A member of the village government suggested, “Facilitators from the government or NGOs knowledgeable of TIP and Anti-TIP mechanisms should conduct sessions with village, ward and district leadership to raise their awareness on TIP problem and their responsibilities in TIP control” [18]. A district official in Bukoba Rural added, “Capacity building to control machinery at the grassroots, district and regional levels is very important … We can hold training sessions at all levels in the district, but if theory is not put into practice; there is no way we could change the situation … Team work building should be a core of this move” [18].

Majority of the study participants put more emphasis on controlling crop diseases as a remedy to TIP impacts in the area. In their views, with adequate food production and surplus for sale from both cash and food crops, no one will leave the village unless drought hits us as in 2016/2017” [18]. All ex-TIP victims mentioned the need for sharing TIP experiences with fellow youth and villagers as means to reduce chances of others being caught in that web. SL1 (SS), SL2 (NJ) and SL3 (DM) promised taking steps in this direction.

**Discussion**

We analyzed life-stories for some ex-TIP victims, held in-depth interviews with different community and village leaders. The advantages of life-stories have been documented by Ssali, et al., (2015) as:

Life-story [or personal account of informant’s life and in her/his own words] allows the researcher to explore a person’s micro-historical (individual) experiences within a macro-historical (history of the time) framework. Life-story information challenges the researcher to understand an individual’s current attitudes and behaviors and how they may have been influenced by initial decisions made at another time and in another place [19].

Certainly, it is clear from life stories and data from interviews presented that internal TIP is uncontrollably ongoing and growing in Kagera Region. The number of individuals trafficked captured in the three life stories justify these observations. TIP flows are mainly rural-rural, rural-urban and urban-urban and within the region. We did not capture urban-urban or out of the region flows, which does not eliminate their practices in the region. Traffickers are known to victims, family members or receive assistance from village authorities [20]. Majority of the females are trafficked for domestic and service labor or sex exploitation. Females trafficked for ‘employment’ in business like food vending, construction, agricultural camps, factories and manufacturing end up in double exploitation: working in harsh conditions for low or no payment and being forced into prostitution (concubines) to supplement their income, safeguarding their jobs or for security [21]. The males are mainly trafficked for labor in construction, fishing, manufacturing, agriculture and security guard companies.

As reported by other studies, MoHSW/NACP (2010), Kamazima et al., (2012) and Kamazima et al., (2016), poverty was reported a key pushing factor for TIP in the study area [4,5,14]. Other factors included low knowledge of TIP and its characteristics and consequences; unawareness of The ATiPAct 2008 and its regulations among community members and the political elite; unawareness of TIP responsibilities among leadership at all levels in the region and economic shocks from the 2015, 2016 and 2017 droughts. Some of the pulling factors reported included, mineral discoveries; unfolding new forms of prostitution; increased urbanization (new district headquarters and several semi-urban areas established); expanding road and building construction; improved communication (use of cell phones); expanding agriculture and expansion of the fishing industry.

However, as indicated earlier, the region has the lowest per capita Gross Domestic Product (GDP) in the nation [22]. Kagera, with a population of about 2,458,023 (2012 census), annual population growth of 3.2% and 82% of the residents engaged in agriculture and contributing about 45% of the GDP and 60% of export earnings, is one of the thirteen regions with highest levels of poverty in the country [23]. Kagera Region has the highest level of poverty, gender disparities and trends of environmental degradation and climatic change impacts. People living in poverty-stricken
areas are at high risk of TIP, low nutrition status, diseases (including HIV and other STIs infections), and human rights violation experiences [5,21]. The most important finding from this study is, perhaps, the perceived link between/among crop diseases, climatic change, and TIP that needs a discussion here. Study participants reported every crop, cash or food, has been affected by diseases, which have received no solutions. It is known that Bahaya grew and consumed Robusta coffee and bananas before contacts with the outside world. The Germans, however, introduced Arabica coffee that settlers and Bahaya grew on a commercial scale [24]. Bukoba exported coffee for the first time in 1898 [25]. According to Hydén (1968), coffee production increased from 234 tons in 1905 to 493 tons in 1910 and about 10,861 tons in 1939 [24]. Jørgen and Karen Rald (1975) observed that with the Bukoba Native Cooperative Union (BCNU, 1941)’s quality control, supervision and support to the farmers, (Bukoba) coffee prices on world markets boomed in the middle of 1950 [26].

However, beginning the 1960s, coffee prices cut down, BCU’s support to the farmers progressively contracted and coffee production costs shot up. From then, coffee returns to the farmers declined and farmers sought alternative cash crops. Beginning in the 1970s, banana became both a food and cash crop in Bahaya. Coffee Wilt Disease (CWD) that previously erupted from time to time in Africa was detected in Kagera in 1996. By the time of this study, Agricultural Officials estimated the disease had infected 2.2% of the farms and 0.7% of Robusta trees in Kagera Region [18], which has further lowered tons of the crop produced in the region.

Similarly, Bahaya are known to have grown and consumed bananas that have more than 100 uses in Bahaya traditions before contacts with the outside world. However, banana production in Bahaya has faced several challenges. According to Muchuruza & Melchior (2013), banana production [in Bahaya] is threatened by various biotic hindrances including pests such as banana weevil and nematodes and diseases. The significant diseases include Black Sigatoka, Fusarium wilt and Banana Xanthomonas Wilt (BXW) which cause yield losses of up to 90% in the farmers’ fields. In 2006, the estimated loss of BXW was 295 million USD worth of banana output valued at farm gate. This expected loss translates into around 200 USD of food and income per household [27].

In the 1930s, for example, banana weevils attacked Bahaya. The British ordered Bahaya to uproot affected bananas and use them to mulch coffee plots. However, the Bahaya “could not understand why this [uprooting] had to be done [they suspected] it was a trick directed to them” (Hydén, 1968). In order to avoid fines, Bahaya decided to uproot coffee trees rather than risk being found with un-mulched coffee farm. Bukara Kingdom residents, Abukara, developed a more overt and popular movement, Twayanga, or “we are not complying” opposing forced banana uprooting.

Jørgen and Karen Rald (1975) reported that during the 1970s, Bahaya had about 183 types of bananas: cooking bananas ebilitoke, roasting bananas enkonjwa, brewing bananas, embile and sweet/snack bananas obunana, much of which have now perished!

According to Wikipedia [28] and Muchuruza & Melchior (2013), BXW was reported about 40 years back in Ethiopia on Ensete ventricosum, a sister plant to banana, caused by Xanthomonas campestris pv musacearum. BXW was recognized in Uganda in 2001; since then it has affected all banana producing countries in the Great Lakes Zone: Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda, Tanzania, Uganda and the Democratic Republic of Congo. Before the BXW outbreak, Tanzania ranked fourth and third in banana production in Africa and East and Central Africa respectively [29]. It produced about 3.7 million tons per year from about 403,000 hectares in 1998. BXW was first reported in Kabale Village, Muleba district in January 2006 and by 2007 it had affected the whole region causing damage between 25% and 100% of some farms. As a result, some farmers opted for diversification (growing crops on high demand on markets – tomatoes, cabbages and vanilla – due to low production compared to costs involved.

Muchuruza & Melchior (2013) have correctly observed,

Before the BXW outbreak, bananas were a staple food for about 15% of the Tanzanians and contributed greatly to household income. BXW outbreak has threatened food security, income and livelihoods in Kagera Region. It is reported that about 65% of households take one meal a day due to the loss of banana and dwindling income from banana production can no longer allow them to take their children to school, they cannot afford health care expenses and most importantly, food security at family level is not assured [27].

Indeed, the 2015, 2016 and 2017 droughts added salt to the wounds. Desperate from loss of bananas, coffee and faced with food insecurity, majority of the youth and young men and women in Kagera embraced paid labor, vibarua, within and outside their villages, processes which demonstrate all features of a modern form of slavery, exploitation and human rights violation, TIP.

Conclusion and Recommendations

TIP is a complex phenomenon and a function of compounded individual, social, economic, cultural and political factors and influences that require multi-sectoral interventions for its control. Many of these factors “tend to be common to trafficking in general or found in a wide range of different regions, patterns or cases” [2]. However, in many cases TIP factors/forces are specific to trafficking flows, trafficking forms and patterns and to areas/nation states within which or between/among which they occur. Kagera region has general and specific factors influencing TIP: poverty, climatic change, gender disparities, prohibited/controlled income generating activities like fishing, crop diseases, increased urbanization and globalization. It is recommended conducting further multidisciplinary qualitative and quantitative research in Kagera to inform efficacious TIP interventions suggested. It is further recommended that the region and its
development partners should give priority to crop disease control, coffee and banana diseases, in particular, and poverty alleviation intervention in Kagera to save residents from other poverty-driven public health concerns.

Acknowledgements

We acknowledge receiving funding for fieldwork from the Rwechungura and Kwasigabo families, Kagera, Tanzania; cooperation from study participants and village, ward, division, district, and region authorities. We also acknowledge colleagues at the Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences for reading and commenting on earlier versions of this paper.

References