

## Research

## Acute Toxicity of Graded Palm Oil Mill Effluents on Nile Tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus* Linnaeus 1758) and African Sharptooth Catfish (*Clarias gariepinus* Burchell, 1822) Fingerlings

Ogaga Augustine Aghoghovwia<sup>1</sup>, Martins Ugolo<sup>1</sup> and Sylvester Chibueze Izah<sup>2\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Fisheries and Aquatic Studies, Faculty of Agriculture, Niger Delta University, Wilberforce Island, Bayelsa State, Nigeria

<sup>2</sup>Department of Biological Sciences, Faculty of Science, Niger Delta University, Wilberforce Island, Bayelsa State, Nigeria

### Abstract

This study evaluated the acute toxicity of graded palm oil mill effluents on Nile tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus* and *Clarias gariepinus*) fingerlings. The fish were obtained from an earthen fish ponds in the Niger Delta University fish farm. The fish were allowed to adapt in a concrete aquarium for 2 weeks. Range findings tests of the palm oil mill effluents were performed. Based on the preliminary results, two series of test concentrations were defined, for *Oreochromis niloticus* ranging between 0.45 and 1.65 mL/L, and for *Clarias gariepinus* ranging between 2.25 and 4.25 mL/L. The experimental set-up was a 24hour renewal bioassay with three replicates each. The results showed behavioural responses including air gulping, surfacing, aberrant swimming, changed opercular movements and changed body pigmentation at varying levels. Mortality rates increased significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) with increasing concentrations of the palm oil mill effluents. The  $LC_{50}$  values of *Oreochromis niloticus* fingerlings exposed to palm oil mill effluents at 24 hours, 48 hours, 72 hours and 96 hours were 2.981 mL/L, 1.437 mL/L, 0.963 mL/L and 0.935 mL/L, respectively. The corresponding  $LC_{50}$  values for *Clarias gariepinus* at 24 hours, 48 hours, 72 hours and 96 hours were 7.501 mL/L, 5.070 mL/L, 3.602 mL/L and 2.919 mL/L, respectively. The  $LC_{50}$  values showed that *Clarias gariepinus* can tolerate higher exposure concentrations of palm oil mill effluents than *Oreochromis niloticus*. The study found that palm oil mill effluents are toxic to fish already at low concentrations. To prevent exposure of fish via runoff, palm oil mills should not be located close to slow flowing surface water. Also direct discharge of effluents into surface water bodies should be prevented.

**Keywords:** Aquatic Ecosystem; Aquatic Pollution; Fish; Palm Oil Mill Effluents; Water Quality

### Introduction

The oil palm is the most productive of all oil bearing crops and has by far exceeded the production of other oil-generating plants such as cotton seed, rapeseed, soybean, groundnut etc. Malaysia, Indonesia, Thailand, Colombia and Nigeria are the leading producing countries accounting for over 90% of total production output. Of these leading countries, Nigeria contributes the least (1 015 000 metric tonnes), about 1.5% of the global output. Oil palm industry in Nigeria is dominated by smallholders. Palm oil processing is a major source of livelihood to several families, especially in southern Nigeria, where oil palm trees are found in the wild and in plantations [1,2,3]. Oil palm cultivation and processing is dominated by smallholders that have only basic equipment for processing available [4].

During palm oil processing three major wastes are produced, including gaseous emissions (air pollutants), solid wastes (empty fruit bunch, palm press fiber, chaff) and liquid wastes (palm oil mill effluents). These wastes are poorly managed in Nigeria. The solid

**\*Corresponding Author:** Sylvester Chibueze Izah, Department of Biological Sciences, Faculty of Science, Niger Delta University, Wilberforce Island, Bayelsa State, Nigeria, E-Mail: chivestizah@gmail.com

**Sub Date:** April 22<sup>nd</sup> 2019, **Acc Date:** May 10<sup>th</sup> 2019, **Pub Date:** May 10<sup>th</sup> 2019

**Citation:** Aghoghovwia OA, Ugolo M, Izah SC (2019) Acute Toxicity of Graded Palm Oil Mill Effluents on Nile Tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus* Linnaeus 1758) and African Sharptooth Catfish (*Clarias gariepinus* Burchell, 1822) Fingerlings. Int J Environ & Agri Sci 3:024.

**Copyright:** © 2019 Izah SC. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

wastes and palm oil mill effluents are produced in large quantities in the production mills. A significant amount of the palm oil mill effluents is discharged directly into the environment while a small quantity is reused during boiling processes in the palm oil mills [5]. These palm oil mill effluents have been reported to be causing environmental pollution (soil, air and water) [6].

In the surface water, palm oil mill effluents turn the water brown, smelly and slimy [7]. This could impact on the downstream application of the water and affect aquatic organisms, especially fish. Authors have reported that palm oil mill effluents alter the physicochemical characteristics (temperature, pH, total alkalinity, total solid, total dissolved solid, total suspended solid, magnesium, calcium, sodium, potassium, chloride, sulphate, nitrate, phosphate, zinc, iron, manganese, dissolved oxygen, biological oxygen demand and oil and grease) of receiving water system [7,8]. Increased nutrient concentrations in the water such as nitrate, sulphate, phosphate could cause eutrophication, while the acid pH could promote possible acidification of the water [6]. Changes in water quality such as pH, temperature, salinity, conductivity, hardness affects the survival of fish and other aquatic organisms in the aquatic ecosystem. Specifically, a decrease in dissolved oxygen content could influence the survival of fish in aquatic ecosystem. Considering the potential of palm oil mill effluents to affect aquatic ecosystems, there is a need for this to be studied. Behavioural response in fish often provides preliminary information about the toxicity to an aquatic ecosystem. Acute toxicity of fish provides vital information about the short term basis of a toxicant on the aquatic ecosystem. Several aquatic organisms such as macrophytes, plankton and fish have been widely used to assess pollution in aquatic ecosystem. Among the fish, *Clarias gariepinus* and *Oreochromis niloticus* are among the common fish species that have been widely used in ecotoxicological studies. Hence this study aimed to assess the acute toxicity of palm oil mill effluents on Nile tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) and African sharp tooth catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*) fingerlings.

## Materials and Methods

### Source of Fish, Transportation and Acclimation

A total of two hundred fingerlings of *Clarias gariepinus* and *Oreochromis niloticus* with a mean weight of 6.5 g ( $\pm 1.22$ ) and a length of 6 cm ( $\pm 1.33$ ) were obtained from the wild in the Niger Delta University earthen fish farm using a drag net. The fish were allowed to adapt to the environment for 14 days. During the adaptation period the fish were fed with fish feed. The palm oil mill effluents used in this study were obtained from a smallholder oil palm processor in Ozoro, Delta state, Nigeria.

### Range Finding Test (Trial Test)

The range finding test was carried out following a renewal bioassay approach. During experimentation, the test toxicant (palm oil mill effluents) and test solution (borehole water) were renewed daily. A range finding test (trial test) was carried out using the palm oil mill effluents in the following concentrations (2.5 mL/L, 5.00 mL/L, 7.50 mL/L and 10.00 mL/L). Each concentrations of the range finding test contained 4 fish individuals.

### Main Experiment

Approximately 0.00 mL, 22.5 mL, 27.5 mL, 32.5 mL, 37.5 mL and 42.5 mL of palm oil mill effluents were pipetted into rectangular aquarium containing 10 litres of water. For *Clarias gariepinus* this resulted in test concentrations of 0.0 (control), 2.25, 2.75, 3.25, 3.75 and 4.25 mL/L. For *Oreochromis niloticus* 0.0 mL, 4.5 mL, 7.5 mL, 10.5 mL, 13.5 mL and 16.5 mL were transferred into 10.0 L of aquarium water each, resulting in test concentrations of 0.0 (control), 0.45, 0.75, 1.05, 1.35 and 1.65 mL/L. The experimental groups (containing 10 fish each) were carried out in triplicate and dispense into (10 L aquarium water and the palm oil mill effluents were renewed every 24 hours Fish were not fed during the 96 hours of exposure. Mortality was determined if a fish did not respond to repeated prodding [9].

### Behavioural Response

Behavioural changes were assessed by observing the movements of the fish based on the characteristics previously reported by Oyoroko and Ogamba [10]. The water quality parameters such as pH, temperature, conductivity and salinity were measured using an in-situ portable meter. The results for pH, temperature, salinity and conductivity ranged from 5.7 – 6.6, 25 – 27 °C, 0.02 – 0.03 mg/l and 63.2 – 74.4  $\mu\text{S}/\text{cm}$ ., respectively, across the various concentrations of the palm oil mill effluents.

### Statistical Analysis

SPSS version 20 was used for the statistical analysis. The data were expressed as mean  $\pm$  standard error. One-way analysis of variance was carried out  $p < 0.05$ , and where significant difference occurred Waller Duncan statistics was used for mean separation. The percentage mortality was converted to Probit using Finney's Table [11], and then a linear regression of the probit values against the logarithm of the concentrations was carried out using Microsoft Excel. The LC50 values were determined by substituting the 50 probit values into the equation derived from the regression analysis and obtaining the anti-logarithm values [12,13].

## Results and Discussion

The behavioural response of *Oreochromis niloticus* and *Clarias gariepinus* exposed to palm oil mill effluents included slight body pigmentation, intermittent swarming and jerky movements that were not observed in the control. Their rate increased as the concentration of the palm oil mill effluents increased. Surfacing and air gulping were low at lower concentration but increased with increasing concentrations of the toxicant. The fish showed moderate swimming

and opercular movement at lower concentrations, movements increased with an increasing concentration. These behavioural responses have been reported before when fingerlings are exposed to toxicants [9,14]. The variation in the response suggest the effect of stress. The increased air gulping and opercular movement suggests respiratory distress, probably due to the effect of oil in the effluents. Oil has the tendency to deprive oxygen in aquatic ecosystem. The various behavioural responses that deviate from the control suggest the effect of stress on the test organisms.

**Table 1:** Mortality rate of *Oreochromis niloticus* fingerlings exposed to graded concentration of palm oil mill effluents

Concentration, mL/L	0 hours	24 hours	48 hours	72 hours	96 hours
0.00	0.00±0.00	0.00±0.00a	0.00±0.00a	0.00±0.00a	0.00±0.00a
0.45	0.00±0.00	6.67±3.33ab	13.33±3.33a	23.33±3.33b	30.00±5.77b
0.75	0.00±0.00	10.00±0.00ab	30.00±5.77b	40.00±0.00c	46.67±3.33b
1.05	0.00±0.00	16.67±3.33b	30.00±5.77b	50.00±5.77c	60.00±5.77b
1.35	0.00±0.00	30.00±5.77c	50.00±5.77c	63.33±6.67d	80.00±5.77d
1.65	0.00±0.00	33.33±3.33c	56.67±3.33c	73.33±3.33d	90.00±5.77d
LC <sub>50</sub> [mL/L]	n.d.	2.981	1.437	0.963	0.935

Data is expressed as mean± standard error (n=3). Different letters along the column indicate significant variations at p<0.05 according to Duncan statistics

**Table 2:** mortality rate of *Clarias gariepinus* fingerlings exposed to graded concentration of palm oil mill effluents

Concentration, mL/L	0 hours	24 hours	48 hours	72 hours	96 hours
0.00	0.00±0.00	0.00±0.00a	0.00±0.00a	0.00±0.00a	0.00±0.00a
2.25	0.00±0.00	13.33±3.33b	20.00±5.77b	26.67±6.67b	33.33±8.82b
2.75	0.00±0.00	13.33±3.33b	23.33±3.33bc	33.33±3.33b	40.00±5.77bc
3.25	0.00±0.00	16.67±3.33b	30.00±5.77bcd	40.00±5.77b	56.67±6.67cd
3.75	0.00±0.00	16.67±3.33b	36.67±3.33cd	53.33±3.33c	73.33±3.33de
4.25	0.00±0.00	36.67±3.33c	43.33±6.67d	63.33±3.33c	80.00±5.77e
LC50 [mL/L]	n.d.	7.501	5.070	3.602	2.919

Data is expressed as mean± standard error (n=3). Different letters along the column indicate significant variations at p<0.05 according to Duncan statistics

Data is expressed as mean± standard error (n=3). Different letters along the column indicate significant variations at p<0.05 according to Duncan statistics The LC<sub>50</sub> values of fingerlings of *Oreochromis niloticus* exposed to palm oil mill effluents at 24 hours, 48 hours, 72 hours and 96 hours were 2.981 mL/L, 1.437 mL/L, 0.963 mL/L and 0.935 mL/L, respectively. For *Clarias gariepinus* for LC<sub>50</sub> values of 7.501 mL/L, 5.070 mL/L, 3.602 mL/L and 2.919 mL/L were observed at 24 hours, 48 hours, 72 hours and 96 hours, respectively.

The mortality rate showed that as the concentration of the palm oil mill effluents increased the mortality rate increased. In addition, no mortality was observed in the control. The observed pattern with mortality increasing with exposure concentrations is typical for toxic effects and is in line with patterns reported by a multitude of authors [9, 10,12,13,15]. Also the increase of effects over time, resulting in

a decline of LC<sub>50</sub>-values over time is typical for prolonged exposure situations. The LC<sub>50</sub> values showed a decline in values as the exposure period increased in fingerlings of both fish species. Lower LC<sub>50</sub> values indicate higher toxicity level. As such, the palm oil mill effluents were more toxic to fingerlings of *Oreochromis niloticus* compare to fingerlings of *Clarias gariepinus*. The findings of this study did not conform with the observation of Akinsorotan [16] reported an LC<sub>50</sub> value of 9.19 mg/L after exposing juvenile *Oreochromis niloticus* to 96 hour of palm oil mill effluents. The observed differences could be due to the age/ size of the fish, and well as the composition of oil mill effluents, which are neither constant over time nor between different oil mills. Anyway, palm oil mill effluents are known to have a low pH, to increase the chemical and biological oxygen demand, total dissolved and suspended solids, debris, heavy metals and alkaline earth metals [16,17,18,19,20,21,22]. Akinsorotan [16] reported that palm oil mill

effluents is toxic to *Oreochromis niloticus* and has the tendency to cause erratic movement, air gulping, loss of reflex, molting, barbell, haemorrhage and excessive mucus secretion. The author also reported that as the exposure period increases it could cause cell proliferation, lamellar fusion, lamellar cell hyperplasia, and epithelial lifting in the gills; and in the liver, it causes vacuolation of hepatocytes and necrosis [23,24,25].

## Conclusion

This study investigated the behavioural response and mortality rate of fingerlings of *Oreochromis niloticus* and *Clarias gariepinus* exposed to palm oil mill effluents. The fish exhibited body pigmentation, intermittent swarming and jerky movement, surfacing and air gulping at the different concentrations. The mortality rates increased as the concentrations of the palm oil mill effluents increased. The  $LC_{50}$  values showed that palm oil mill effluents are more lethal to fingerlings of *Oreochromis niloticus* than to *Clarias gariepinus* fingerlings. This suggests that *Clarias gariepinus* can tolerate the toxicity of palm oil mill effluents than *Oreochromis niloticus*. Due to the risk that palm oil mill effluents can induce toxic effects in fish, processing mills should not be located close to surface water system that could receive the effluents after rainfall, and also effluents should never be discharged directly into adjacent surface water bodies.

## References

1. Ohimain EI, Emeti CI, Izah SC (2014) Employment and socioeconomic effects of semi-mechanized palm oil mill in Bayelsa state, Nigeria. Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension and Sociology 3(3): 206-216.
2. Ohimain EI, Oyedeji AA, Izah SC (2012) Employment effects of smallholder oil palm processing plants in Elele, Rivers State, Nigeria. International Journal of Applied Research and Technology 1(6): 83-93.
3. Izah SC, Ohimain EI (2016) The opportunities and weakness of Nigerian oil palm industry. Biotechnology Research 2(1): 33-43.
4. Ohimain EI, Izah SC (2014) Energy self-sufficiency of smallholder oil palm processing in Nigeria. Renewable Energy 63: 426-431.
5. Ohimain EI, Izah SC (2013) Water minimization and optimization by small-scale palm oil mill in Niger Delta, Nigeria. Journal of Water Research 135: 190-198.
6. Izah SC, Angaye TCN, Ohimain EI (2016) Environmental Impacts of Oil palm processing in Nigeria. Biotechnological Research 2(3): 132-141
7. Awotoye OO, Dada AC, Arawomo GAO (2011) Impact of palm oil processing effluent discharging on the quality of receiving soil and rivers in South Western Nigeria. Journal of Applied Sciences Research 7(2): 111-118.
8. Edward JB, Idowu EO, Oyebola OE (2015) Impact of pam oil mill effluent on physic-chemical parameters of a southwestern River, Ekiti state, Nigeria. Journal of Natural Sciences Research 5(14): 26 -30.
9. Oyoroko E, Ogamba EN (2017) Toxicity of Detergent Containing Linear Alkyl benzene Sulphonate on Some Commonly Cultured Fish Species in the Niger Delta. Journal of Environmental Treatment Techniques 5(2): 72-77.
10. Oyoroko E, Ogamba EN (2017) Effects of detergent containing linear alkyl benzene sulphonate on behavioural response of Heterobranchus bidorsalis, *Clarias gariepinus* and *Heteroclaris*. Biotechnological Research 3(3): 59-64.
11. Finney DJ (1971) Probit Analysis. Cambridge University Press London United Kingdom 123-125.
12. Aghoghovwia OA, Izah SC (2018) Acute Toxicity of Paraquat Dichloride Based Herbicide against *Heterobranchus bidorsalis* Fingerlings. EC Agriculture 4(2): 128-132.
13. Aghoghovwia OA, Izah SC (2018) Toxicity of glyphosate based herbicides to fingerlings of *Heterobranchus bidorsalis*. International Journal of Avian & Wildlife Biology 3(5): 397-400.
14. Inyang IR, Ajimmy R, Izah SC (2017) Organosomatic index and behavioral response of heterobranchus bidorsalis exposed to rhonasate 360sl containing glyphosate (isopropylamine salt glycine). ASIO Journal of Microbiology, Food Science & Biotechnological Innovations 3(1): 4-8.
15. Seiyaboh EI, Izah SC (2018) Mortality rate of juvenile *Heterobranchus bidorsalis* exposed to cassava mill effluents. Annals of Research and Review 4(1): 555628.
16. Akinsorotan AM (2013) Histopathological Effects Of Acutely Toxic Levels Of Palm Oil Mill Effluent On Gill And Liver Of Nile Tilapia Fingerlings. International Journal Of Scientific & Engineering Research 4(3): 1-8.
17. Ohimain EI, Seiyaboh EI, Izah SC, Oghenegueke VE, Perewarebo TG (2012) Some selected physico-chemical and heavy metal properties of palm oil mill effluents. Greener Journal of Physical Sciences 2(4): 131-137.

- 
18. Ohimain EI, Izah SC, Jenakumo N (2013) Physicochemical and microbial screening of palm oil mill effluents for amylase production. Greener Journal of Biological Sciences 3(8): 307-318.
  19. Ohimain EI, Izah SC (2017) A review of biogas production from palm oil mill effluents using different configurations of bioreactors. Renewable & Sustainable Energy Reviews 70: 242-253.
  20. Ohimain EI, Izah SC (2014) Potential of Biogas Production from Palm Oil Mills' Effluent in Nigeria. Sky Journal of Soil Sciences and Environmental Management 3(5): 50-58.
  21. Ohimain EI, Izah SC (2014) Possible contributions of palm oil mill effluents to greenhouse gas emissions in Nigeria. British Journal of Applied Science and Technology 4(33): 4705-4720.
  22. Ohimain EI, Izah SC (2014) Estimation of potential electrical energy and currency equivalent from un-tapped palm oil mill effluents in Nigeria. International Journal of Farming and Allied Science 3 (8): 855-862.
  23. Inyang IR, Ollor AO, Izah SC (2017) Effect of Diazinon on Organosomatic Indices and Behavioural Responses of *Clarias gariepinus* (a Common Niger Delta Wetland Fish). Greener Journal of Biological Sciences 7(2): 15-19.
  24. Inyang IR, Izah SC, Johnson DT, Ejomarie OA (2017) Effects of Lambda cyhalothrin on some electrolytes and metabolites in organs of *Parpohiocephalus obscurus*. Biotechnological Research 3(1): 6-10.
  25. Inyang IR, Seiyaboh EI, Job UB (2017) Condition Factor, Organosomatic Indices and behavioural Abnormalities of *Clarias gariepinus* exposed to Lambda Cyhalothrin. Greener Journal of Life Sciences 4(1): 001-005.